

**Summary of Dr Crisp's Carmichael essay on medical reform and medical education : suggestions and conclusions as directed by Mr Carmichael under the three heads.**

**Contributors**

Crisp, Edwards, 1806-1882.  
Royal College of Surgeons of England

**Publication/Creation**

[Chelsea] : [29, Beaufort St], [1870]

**Persistent URL**

<https://wellcomecollection.org/works/zyrf88u3>

**Provider**

Royal College of Surgeons

**License and attribution**

This material has been provided by This material has been provided by The Royal College of Surgeons of England. The original may be consulted at The Royal College of Surgeons of England. where the originals may be consulted. This work has been identified as being free of known restrictions under copyright law, including all related and neighbouring rights and is being made available under the Creative Commons, Public Domain Mark.

You can copy, modify, distribute and perform the work, even for commercial purposes, without asking permission.



Wellcome Collection  
183 Euston Road  
London NW1 2BE UK  
T +44 (0)20 7611 8722  
E [library@wellcomecollection.org](mailto:library@wellcomecollection.org)  
<https://wellcomecollection.org>

*Do not cut this Tract. up.*  
*Tracts 1880*  
SUMMARY OF DR. CRISP'S CARMICHAEL ESSAY ON  
MEDICAL REFORM AND MEDICAL EDUCATION, (1867.)

SUGGESTIONS AND CONCLUSIONS AS DIRECTED BY MR. CARMICHAEL,  
UNDER THE THREE HEADS.

That the Medical Profession in the United Kingdom, in the Army, Navy, and in the Colonies, is in a most unsatisfactory and disgraceful state, owing to the number of antagonistic licensing bodies that require different curricula and adopt different modes of examination.

That the Medical Registration Act, 1858, although it has in some respects tended to produce greater uniformity as regards education and examination, has, by placing these Corporations on a firmer basis by the licensing of diplomas of all kinds (many of which before did not qualify for practice), been positively injurious, by encouraging the registration and increase of half-qualified men and incompetent practitioners.

That since the passing of this Act, 1858 (for which the profession has paid about £40,000.), no less than 759 men have been placed on the Register with one qualification. (Up to 1869, £77,959 14 4½).

That more than one-fourth of the practitioners in the United Kingdom are practising with only one diploma; more than 2,000 with the non-medical diploma of the College of Surgeons of England; and more than 600 with the non-surgical diploma of the London Apothecaries' Company. The remainder, holding single diplomas, are generally but inadequately qualified.

That in the Army\* there are 866 English diplomas, 916 Scotch, and 531 Irish. With English and Irish diplomas, 46; English and Scotch, 138; Scotch and Irish, 62.

That the number of Surgeons in the Army with one qualification is 395, whilst those in the Navy amount to 186. Of these, 195 are members of the College of Surgeons of England only. That out of those practising in the Colonies, the Packet and other services, there are 100 with one qualification only.

That there are more than 300 graduates of Edinburgh with this degree only, and that the greater number of these Edinburgh graduates reside out of Scotland. That the graduates of St. Andrew's amount to more than 1,300;

\* In addition, in the army, two or more diplomas; English, 179; Irish, 80; Scotch, 204; English and Scotch, 131; English and Irish, 47; Scotch and Irish, 62. Navy: one degree English (R.C.S.E.), 89; Irish, 34; Scotch, 63. Two or more diplomas: English, 47; Irish, 17; Scotch, 36; English and Scotch, 52; English and Irish, 21; Scotch and Irish, 20. Of the 2,113 army diplomas, the English bear about the proportion of 1 in 23,550 to the population; the Irish, 1 in 1,200; and the Scotch, 1 in 333. Register, 1867.

It must be remembered that these gentlemen have also passed the Army and Navy Boards. *After-notes, 1867.*



a very few of these have a single degree; and that the graduates of this University possess a larger number of medico-chirurgical diplomas than those belonging to any other University in the United Kingdom (see page 31).

That more than nineteen-twentieths of the above-named practitioners have no voice in the management of their own affairs, nor a vote in the Corporate body to which they belong.

That the vast majority of votes, when allowed, as at all the Colleges of Physicians, the College of Surgeons, (in the majority of instances,) the Edinburgh College of Surgeons, and the Faculty of Physicians and Surgeons at Glasgow, are bought by the payment of sums varying from ten to fifty guineas; in other examples the affairs of the Corporation are governed by a small self-elected clique, that have an interest in the sale of the diplomas and in the division of profits.

That the great body of the profession, ninety-nine in a hundred, although they have been praying for many years for a representative form of government, have had no voice in the election of the Medical Council; and that in this Council the general practitioners of the United Kingdom are scarcely represented.

That this Council is composed almost exclusively of men who are connected with the Corporations, and have a direct interest in continuing the system of self-election and irresponsible government in these Corporations, that the great majority of the members of the profession have so long protested against; and that the President of this Council and the Secretary in their Parliamentary evidence, both objected to a general system of medical registration.

That the Council is composed of eight Englishmen, nine or more Scotchmen, and seven Irishmen; the Scotch, in proportion to the population, forming about 1 in 333,333, the Irish 1 in 857,142, and the English 1 in  $2\frac{1}{2}$  millions!

That more than half of the members of this Council have only one medical or one surgical qualification.

That in 1867, in the United Kingdom, 929 students were registered; for England 459, for Ireland 212, and for Scotland 258; and the teachers and examiners amount to 792.\*

That the annual Prizes at the Academy of Medicine and the Academy of Sciences of Paris, and at other institutions, amount to more than £8,000. yearly; those in the United Kingdom have not equalled £150. a-year.

That in the Houses of Parliament the medical profession is represented by only two† medical practitioners, whilst both Houses are crowded with members of the legal profession; and the Church, directly in the upper House, and indirectly in the lower, has a numerous staff of interested advocates..

That in the legal profession (and the same may be said of the Church) the rewards, pensions, and salaries, amount to an enormous sum yearly (£785,828.), whilst to the members of the medical profession is meted out a miserable pittance.

---

\* Many examiners and teachers; some, too, lecture and teach two or more subjects.

† One of these, Dr. Brady, has done his utmost, I believe, to benefit the profession; but what is he against so many? [I did not know at this time that Sir J. Gray and Mr. Vanderbyl were members,]



That the only effectual method of correcting this incongruous state of things is to establish a Faculty of Medicine in each of the three Kingdoms, the Councillors of which Faculty shall be elected by the whole profession, and be paid by the State.

That this Council shall have the power of selecting examiners in medicine, surgery, pharmacy, and other branches of medical science, from the various Universities, Colleges of Physicians, Surgeons, and Apothecaries' Companies, and for the degree in Arts, from any part of Her Majesty's dominions.

That after a certain time all who practise medicine and surgery shall take the degree of Bachelor of Arts in the above Faculty before they commence their medical studies.

That all who enter the medical profession shall undergo two examinations—one in medicine and its collateral branches, the other in surgery as regulated by the Council of the Faculty; that all shall take the degree of Licentiate of Medicine and Surgery, which shall alone qualify them to be on the Register.

That these examinations shall be made as practical as possible, by placing drugs and chemicals before the candidate, by anatomical examination on the dead body, by the use of the microscope, and as far as practicable by the investigation of diseases on the living subject.

That the four subjects now thought unnecessary by the Medical Council—Botany, Zoology, Histology, and Hygiene—shall form a part of the examination.

That an examination in Midwifery and the Diseases of Women and Children should also form a compulsory part of the examination at the Faculty—not, as at present, be left to the option of the candidate.

That as it is utterly impossible, even by the present system of puffing and cramming, to crowd into a student's head in four years (the time now demanded by the licensing boards of this country) the various subjects necessary for an efficient examination, the time required for acquiring professional knowledge shall be six instead of four years, and that the age of the candidate shall be twenty-two or twenty-three years before he passes his final examination and is qualified to be on the Register.

That all the verbal examinations shall be conducted in public.

That the efficient test of a man's qualification to practise shall be, as far as possible, a good searching examination that will ensure a foundation for practice, the accurate registration of facts, and the right mode of inference from these facts.

That all these changes must be gradual, and care must be taken not to make the course of study *so expensive* as to shut out the *poor and industrious student*.

That nothing herein suggested shall interfere with the present Universities, Colleges, and Halls, which shall continue to grant degrees as at present; but that hereafter all members of the Faculty, and all those on the Register shall have taken the degree of Licentiate of Medicine and Surgery of the Faculty before taking such degrees.

That no person shall be allowed to sell or dispense drugs and chemicals without undergoing a proper examination by a Government Board, the examiners of which shall not be teachers, and shall have no interest whatever in the examining fees.

That counter practice (prescribing for all ailments), which is now carried



on to a greater extent than ever (backed by the diploma of the Pharmaceutical Society), by unqualified practitioners, to the detriment, especially of the junior members of the profession, shall be made illegal, as in France and other countries.

That as soon as the chemists and druggists in the United Kingdom undergo a compulsory examination,\* and a proper system of drug inspection is instituted, it will be desirable, as far as is practicable, to separate medicine from the practice of pharmacy.

That the state of the Veterinary profession, so intimately connected with the science of medicine, is in a most unsatisfactory and disgraceful condition in England and Scotland, and that in Ireland no Veterinary school exists.

That at the three Veterinary schools in France, as shewn by the Appendix, the course of instruction for a Veterinary student is longer by eighteen months than that of a Medical student in the United Kingdom; and that four subjects—botany, zoology, histology, and hygiene—form a part of the Veterinary student's examination in France that are thought by our Medical Council unnecessary for an English medical student's examination.

## CONCLUSIONS, 1870.

That from an analysis I have made of this year's Irish Medical Directory, 1870,† there are 2,350 names recorded. Of the various practitioners enumerated, there are 2,136 Irish degrees, 1,903 Scotch and English—1,347 of the former, and 556 of the latter.

That in Ireland 607 are practising with one degree only, and 187 of these with the Licence of the Dublin Apothecaries' Company.

That although the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge, and Durham do not afford five Doctors of Medicine annually, they return three members to the Medical Council, whilst more than 20,000 members of the profession are unrepresented.

That at the Pharmaceutical Society, consisting of about 3,000 members, the Twelve Examiners are elected by the Council, and the Council by the general body.

\* Since this was written, (1867,) the examination has been made compulsory, but the examiners are wholesale or retail chemists and druggists. As regards counter practice, this is not likely to be done away with until general practitioners abandon pharmacy.

† As will be seen at page 41, in my first Carmichael Essay, 1859, the analysis of that year gave 981 Scotch degrees and 477 English. I select the names in the Directory, 1870, for the purpose of comparison, but a large number of the addresses are unknown; probably, 2,000 practitioners would be about the number, but this does not affect the general conclusion. All the analyses are made by myself.



## APPENDIX.

---

### THE STATE OF THE VETERINARY PROFESSION IN THE UNITED KINGDOM.

This question is so intimately connected with everything that concerns the progress of medical science and the good of the profession, as I hope to shew hereafter, that I make no apology for introducing it as an Appendix to this essay. We can scarcely be said to have any efficient mode of instruction for our Veterinary students in the United Kingdom. Up to a late period those who examined them were members of the medical profession, and at the present time, to use the language of one of the few reformers among the Veterinarians, Mr. Ferwick, ("Veterinarian," July, 1829), "A joint-stock company where gentlemen send their horses at the cheapest rate, and where human surgeons, ignorant of the anatomy and diseases of horses, are the examiners."

For thirty-seven years, only one member of the Veterinary Profession was allowed to be on the examining Board. The College receives £200 a-year from the Royal Agricultural Society, the members of which society and other subscribers have the liberty of sending diseased animals free of cost.

There is one advantage this College has over our Medical Corporations, viz., that the representative system is *fully* adopted; ladies and members of Parliament being allowed to vote by proxy, a kind of constituency not becoming a scientific body. I am unwilling to make an ill-natured remark, but it must be apparent to all that, like many of our Medical Corporations this body is very far behind similar institutions on the Continent—that the system of education and instruction is very inefficient. A new Charter is now prayed for, one object of which is to prevent those calling themselves Veterinary Surgeons who are not members of the College. If this Charter is granted it will only add another piece to the patchwork, and effect but little scientific good. The members of this College are about 1,000; a very inadequate number for the supply of the United Kingdom, as was fully shewn during the late outbreak of Cattle Plague. In Scotland, the Veterinary College, under the Highland Society, is in a more unsatisfactory state; and in Ireland *there is no Veterinary Instruction of any kind*. A friend in Dublin tells me "that Mr. Peele was the last Veterinary Professor in Ireland, 1827."

The Government should at once establish a Veterinary College in Dublin upon a liberal basis, with an annual grant of money to make the institution entirely independent of annual subscribers. The same should be done in England and Scotland; there is no other means of making this body efficient and respectable. A College so instituted might, as in France, Austria, and Germany, go hand-in-hand with our medical and surgical institutions, and thus effect great good.

---

### THE STATE OF THE VETERINARY PROFESSION IN FRANCE.

I will now place before the reader, by way of contrast, the state of the Veterinary profession in France. Here, there are three Veterinary Colleges, as there are three schools of Human medicine—Alfort, founded 1765; Lyons,



1762; and Toulouse, 1761. During three recent visits to Paris, I have made it my duty to visit the school of Alfort, and to enquire into the course of study and mode of examination of the students of this College. The regulations are the same at Lyons and Toulouse.

All appointments, as at the medical schools, up to the grade of *aggrégé* are competitive (by *concours*). The students are boarded and partly provided for by the Government. At the present time, (October 1867), there are about 250 students at this school, besides those of Lyons and Toulouse. Each student on admission must be between 17 and 25 years of age; he must produce certificates of birth and good conduct. Those only are admitted who can pass a satisfactory examination in the French language, arithmetic, geometry, geography, with a written narrative of some subject treating of geography and history. For his board, the student pays 450 francs yearly; he remains at the school for four years, the only holidays being Sundays and fête days. In addition to his board, he finds his dress (blue clothes with gilt buttons), and his under-clothing. The diploma is fixed at 100 francs. Besides the ordinary students, 40 military students are maintained by the Government, who must be the sons of persons in the army, and recommended by the Ministers of War. No student leaves the establishment, which is surrounded by extensive grounds, without permission from the Director.

At the three Veterinary schools, 178 rewards (*demibourses*) are yearly given to the most deserving students, and the half-yearly reports (*notes semestrielles*) of progress, are the only documents consulted by the minister for the distribution of these rewards.

The course of study is as follows:—1st year, Anatomy, Natural Philosophy, Mechanics, Chemistry, Botany, and Histology. 2nd year, Anatomy, Physiology, Zoology, Chemistry, Materia Medica, Botany, Histology, and the structure of the different domesticated animals. 3rd, Pathology, Hygiene, and Agriculture. 4th year, Breeding of animals, Anatomy, Physiology, and Pathology (theoretical and practical).

Several Lectures are given daily by the Professors (paid by the Government), who have obtained their appointments by *concours*, and who have distinguished themselves by their various writings and discoveries. I need scarcely say that the examiners at the Medical and Veterinary schools have no pecuniary interest in the examination.

I will not offend the reader by asking him to contrast this state of things in France with that which I have described in the United Kingdom, but I ask him if a Veterinary surgeon in France is required to be examined in Botany, Zoology, and Hygiene, why should these important subjects not of necessity form a part of the examination of medical students in England?

It must be observed that these students are educated at the expense of the Government. They pay nothing for attendance upon Lectures, as the professors are remunerated by the State, and that when time is taken into account, the period, compared with that of the medical students in England is one year longer; for our medical session is only about nine months. When I passed the London College of Surgeons, it was necessary that a student should be *twenty-two* years of age, and that he should have been engaged for *six years* in the acquirement of professional knowledge; but now the age is twenty-one years, and the period of acquiring professional knowledge limited to *four years*, so much for the progress of science in England in this the 19th century! 2,173 persons in the United Kingdom, in



the Army, Navy, and in the Colonies, are practising with this non-medical diploma only, although more than nineteen-twentieths of the practice of every medical man, civil, military, or naval, is medical.

But let me return from this vital digression to the state of the Veterinary Profession in the United Kingdom. As I have recently said, in Ireland there is not a single teacher of veterinary science; let us suppose cattle plague appears in Ireland (a very likely circumstance), and is undiscovered until the poison is disseminated in various parts of the country, where are the veterinary surgeons to carry out the requirements of the Privy Council? During our late visitation in England, the want of proper inspectors (from the neglect of veterinary science by the Government) was fearfully felt, but what would be the condition of things in Ireland with the horse-leech and the cow-doctor? I have good reason to believe that if Ireland had been provided with an efficient class of Veterinary Practitioners, pleuropneumonia would not have made the ravages it has done among cattle in many parts of Ireland, and that the importations of the disease to England would have been less extensive. This is a question that concerns every well-wisher of his country, and the sooner the Irish people begin to stir in the matter the better. It is one of the many grievances of this part of Her Majesty's dominions.

I have, however, another motive for introducing this question of the state of the Veterinary profession in the United Kingdom in this Appendix, viz., the great bearing it has upon the progress of medical science. In France, Belgium, Germany, and Austria, where veterinary surgeons are well instructed, many subjects of great physiological and pathological importance are referred to certain Professors of the Veterinary Profession, who, from their greater knowledge of the structure of our domesticated animals, are better able to decide. Many of these Veterinary Professors, too, have made important discoveries in anatomy, physiology, and pathology. To give a practical illustration, let me quote an investigation now going on at the Academy of Medicine in Paris. M. Villemin, as shewn in his work, "*Etudes sur la Tuberculose, Preuves Rationnelles, Experimentales, de sa Specificité, et de son Inoculabilité, 1867,*" has shewn that tubercle, or something very much allied to it, may be conveyed from man to the rabbit and to other animals; he believes that "tubercle is a zymotic and contagious disease." His book is now before the Academy of Medicine, and for the proper investigation of this important matter—one of the most important as regards human mortality that could come before a body of scientific men—the Academy appoints certain persons who are thought to be most competent to investigate the subject and make their report. Among these is the well-known and laborious experimentalist, M. Colin, the Professor of Pathology at Alfort, the school I have just described.

When will a Faculty of Medicine of England, Ireland, or Scotland appoint a Veterinary Professor to investigate any subject connected with human pathology? When will all our *medical* students be *examined* upon subjects that are thought necessary for a Horse Doctor in France? And lastly, when will our Government cease from patronising quackery and imposition by its stamp, and from taking money at the same time from the qualified practitioner for his registration fee and for his diploma? These conclusions were written in 1867, and I had not time to add some of the statistics, 759 single degrees, and the Army and Navy statistics.



## PREDICTION 1870.

As I have said, the above summary was written in 1867. Since this period all Chemists and Druggists in England are obliged to pass an examination (p. 48.) The London College of Surgeons (which, like the College of Physicians, should be a Commonalty) has opened its Hall to the members, although, as I have said at page 35, the change is one rather of necessity than of choice. The members assembled passed resolutions in favour of a One Portal for all, based on the representative system, and nearly 10,000 medical practioners, 1870, have petitioned Government for the like reforms. Notwithstanding these unmistakable expressions on the part of the profession, Earl De Grey is to introduce a Bill in the House of Lords, the second reading of which is fixed for the 2nd of May; in this Bill not a word is said about the representative system, and if the Corporations, "*in consequence of the services they have rendered,*" (see pages 8 to 12, 30, 32, 34.) do not agree, the matter is to be referred to the Committee of Corporations, the General Medical Council, (page 10.)

I leave the reader to his reflections, and in conclusion I volunteer a prediction. I have stated that Botany, Zoology, Histology, and Hygiene, subjects now ignored by our Medical Council; in the year 1970, will not only form part of every Student's examination, but that the whole system of examination will be changed; Students will not only be required to know the structure and anatomy of plants and animals, but they will be required to know their diseases—to trace the various forms of structural derangement, from the lowest forms of organization to the highest; a beautiful and wonderful revelation, that will lead to more practical good than any method of research yet pursued?

29, Beaufort Street, Chelsea,

April 25th, 1870.